BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF SOUTH CAROLINA

[Anderson, South Carolina]

HEARING # 10-11091

MARCH 8, 2010

6:00 P.M.

DOCKET NO. 2009-479-WS:

UNITED UTILITY COMPANIES, INC. - Application for Adjustment of Rates and Charges, and Modification to Certain Terms and Conditions for the Provision of Water and Sewer Services

TRANSCRIPT OF TESTIMONY AND PROCEEDINGS

VOLUME 3

HEARING BEFORE: Elizabeth B. 'Lib' FLEMING, *CHAIRMAN*, John E. "Butch" HOWARD, *VICE CHAIRMAN*; and COMMISSIONERS David A. WRIGHT, G. O'Neal HAMILTON, Swain E. WHITFIELD, and Randy MITCHELL.

ADVISOR TO COMMISSION: Josh Minges, Esq.

STAFF: Jocelyn G. Boyd, Interim Chief Clerk/Administrator; James Spearman, Ph.D., Executive Assistant to Commissioners; Phil Riley and William O. Richardson, Advisory Staff; Patty Sands, Executive Staff; and Jo Elizabeth M. Wheat, CVR-CM-GNSC, Court Reporter.

APPEARANCES:

JOHN M.S. HOEFER, ESQUIRE, representing UNITED UTILITY COMPANIES, INC., APPLICANT

WILLIAM H. JORDAN, ESQUIRE, representing NORTH GREENVILLE UNIVERSITY, INTERVENOR

NANETTE S. EDWARDS, ESQUIRE, representing THE OFFICE OF REGULATORY STAFF

Public Service Commission of South Carolina

I N D E X

<u> </u>	
	PAGE
TESTIMONY of JEFF BENNETT Cross Examination by Mr. Hoefer Cross Examination by Mr. Jordan Examination by Chairman Fleming	218 220 222 223
TESTIMONY of DARREL M. ROGERS	224 225
TESTIMONY of ARTHUR B. BROWN, JR. Cross Examination by Mr. Hoefer Cross Examination by Mr. Jordan Examination by Commissioner Mitchell	226 227 227 228
REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE	232

NIGHT HEARING/ANDERSON - VOLUME 3

PROCEEDINGS

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Good evening, everyone.

We'll now call this hearing to order. And we are delighted to have you here tonight. This is a lovely facility, and so it's a treat for us to be

in Anderson and to hear what you have to say

tonight.

And Representative Bowen, we appreciate your being here, and look forward to hearing from you in a few minutes, as well. And we are having this hearing tonight as a result of a request from Representative Bowen.

At this time, I want to introduce the Commissioners up here. I am Lib Fleming and I Chair the Commission. And to my left is Commissioner O'Neal Hamilton, Commissioner David Wright, and Commissioner Butch Howard, who is Vice Chair of the Commission. And to my right is Commissioner Swain Whitfield and Commissioner Randy Mitchell.

And this is Attorney Ran- -- I started to say another -- this is Attorney Josh Minges. And I even have it written down here. And he will at this time read the docket.

MR. MINGES: Thank you, Madam Chairman. Good

Carolina.

evening, folks. This proceeding before the Public
Service Commission in Docket No. 2009-479-WS

concerns the application of United Utility

Companies, Incorporated, for a rate increase.

A public hearing has been scheduled in this

matter at 6 p.m. on March 8, 2010, at the Anderson

County Council Chambers in Anderson, South

Now, if I could get the parties to introduce themselves, I'll start with Mr. Hoefer.

MR. HOEFER: Madam Chairman and members of the Commission, I am John Hoefer. I'm with the firm of Willoughby & Hoefer, in Columbia. We represent the Applicant, United Utility Companies, Incorporated. With me at tonight's meeting are the regional director of United Utility Companies, Mr. Bruce Haas; a customer care representative, Annette Bailey; and one of the system operators, Mr. Mark Johnson. Also Area Manager Larry Chitwood, who has attended the first two hearings in this proceeding, will be joining us, and all of them will be available to answer any questions that the customers or others may have after the hearing.

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Thank you.

MR. JORDAN: Good evening. I'm Will Jordan

2.0

2.1

2.0

2.1

from the firm Smith Moore Leatherwood, and we are representing North Greenville University, one of the Intervenors in this action.

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Thank you.

MS. EDWARDS: Good evening. My name is

Nanette Edwards, and I'm an attorney with the South

Carolina Office of Regulatory Staff. And to my

immediate right is Mr. Willie Morgan, program

manager for our Water and Wastewater Department,

and we will also be available, should any of the

customers have any questions.

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Thank you.

MR. MINGES: And as Commissioner Fleming mentioned, Representative Bowen is present in the audience here. Mr. Bowen, at this time, if you have any comments, we would welcome them.

REP. BOWEN: Is this microphone on? We've had a lot of people here in Anderson County that have been concerned about their the water rates. In fact, I met with County Council this morning. We were running a petition, and we've got over 200 signatures to get special-purpose district lines moved. Now, this is another issue where we have a for-profit water company, and these people -- I know that there are times when you have rate

2.0

2.1

increases, but during these trying economic times I feel like that y'all should give very special consideration when we have a lot of retired people. This particular group -- I think there are 16 on one street, that this water issue pertains to, and their issues are very important to me, and very near and dear to me, too, because I work so closely with water issues in my area. And I felt like while it was -- maybe -- you may not feel like it was a burden for y'all to come up here; I felt like they deserve the right to be heard on the issues that they have with regard to water.

Now, in my district, during the last election, people lost 40 to 60 percent of their life savings, and what they have left they maybe get -- where they were getting 10, 20 percent, now they're getting 1 or 2 percent. So they have been adversely impacted by this recession that we find ourselves in the midst of.

So I'm asking y'all to be compassionate with how y'all administer water rates to these people, because once these rates have been increased it's almost impossible to have them decreased in a forprofit company such as this.

And that's pretty well my stance. We have --

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

15

17

18

19

2.0

2.1

22

23

24

25

Docket No 2009-479-WS United Utility Cos., Inc./ Rates and Charges you, very much. 11 12 13 14 16

I think one person here is going to be the spokesman for this small neighborhood, and I do certainly appreciate y'all coming to hear these people, but I think they should be heard. Thank

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: We agree with you and look forward to hearing from them. Thank you.

MR. MINGES: Thank you, Representative Bowen. Now, in a moment, I'll be calling the names of those of you who signed up to speak to come forward and be sworn in. Make sure you give your name and address and then proceed with your testimony. And remember to speak into the microphone for the court reporter, because what you say will become a part of the record of the case. And after you're done, please remain at the stand for any questions that the parties or the Commissioners might have.

I'd like to remind everyone that this is your time to be heard on the rate case, the proposed rate case, but the Commissioners will not be taking any questions. United Utility and, as Ms. Nanette Edwards mentioned, the Office of Regulatory Staff will be available after the hearing for any questions that you might have.

And lastly, I'd like to note that another

public hearing is scheduled in Gaffney on March 1 15th, and the final hearing will be held in Columbia at the Commission's hearing room on March 3 23rd. And it's the Commission's policy, unless 4 directed otherwise, that you only testify at one of 5 these hearings. 6 With that, I'll call the first witness. Jeff 7 Bennett, will you please come forward and be sworn 8

in?

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Mr. Hoefer.

MR. MINGES: Oh, I'm sorry.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

2.1

22

23

24

25

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Mr. Hoefer.

MR. HOEFER: Thank you, Madam Chairman. While the witness is coming forward, I just wanted to state the same objection that's been stated for the record at prior night hearings. The Applicant would like to state its objection to testimony regarding quality of service not substantiated by data or not made based upon scientific criteria. The bases for this objection are <u>Patton versus PSC</u>, reported at 312 S.E.2d 257; Court of Common Pleas' order in Tega Cay Water Service, Inc., versus PSC, Civil Action No. 97-CP-40-0923; and Commission Order No. 1990-191, Docket No. 96-137-WS.

The Applicant would request that this

NIGHT HEARING/ANDERSON - VOLUME 3

2.0

2.1

objection be deemed a continuing objection, such that there would not be a need for repeated objections each time objectionable testimony is given, and cites in support of that request the case of <u>State v. Douglas</u>, reported at 626 S.E.2d 59.

This continuing objection would also apply to documents and testimony elicited from customers under examination by the parties or the Commission.

And I would ask that the Commission defer ruling on the continuing objection until a final order is issued in this case.

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Ms. Edwards?

MS. EDWARDS: Thank you, Madam Chairman. If I may respond to --

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Is your microphone on?

MS. EDWARDS: I thought it was, but evidently not [indicating]. Thank you, Madam Chairman. I would like to briefly respond. It is ORS's position that while we don't oppose the continuing objection process presented by the company, we do believe that the testimony the company is objecting to is admissible for the purposes of this night hearing. We would like to reserve our right to respond in writing to the company's bases for its

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

2.1

22

23

24

25

continuing objection. We would ask that, within a reasonable time after this night hearing and after the company has had an opportunity to review the hearing transcript, that the company would set forth the specific portions of the testimony to which they object, the basis for that objection, and the name of the person who provided that This would allow those who took time to testimony. testify here tonight to know what portion of their testimony is being objected to. And thank you, very much, for consideration of our responses. CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Thank you. MR. JORDAN: Thank you, Madam Commissioner. 14 We would just renew our response made at the other

hearings, and just state that we believe that a public hearing like this is an appropriate place for the customers to state their involvement with the company and their interaction with the company, and would ask the Commission consider that. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Okay, thank you. We'll take it under advisement, the issues, and rule in the final order.

> Thank you, Madam chair. MR. HOEFER: [Witness sworn/affirmed]

> > NIGHT HEARING/ANDERSON - VOLUME 3

THEREUPON came,

2.0

2.1

JEFF BENNETT,

who, having been first duly sworn/affirmed, testified as follows:

witness: My name is Jeff Bennett, and I live at 33 Pinerock Drive, in Travelers Rest, South Carolina. I live in a subdivision, Cherokee Valley, right behind North Greenville University. And we are -- or, I am serviced, and North Greenville University is serviced by United Utility, as far as our sewer service goes. And I think it's important to note that United Utility, for sewer service, is the only option that we have.

In 2006, in the summer of, United Utility made a request for a rate increase, and I don't have that number exactly but I believe it was in excess of about 30 percent. I visited the attorneys with North Greenville University, and went -- and I was able to sit in those negotiations, and after our meeting, about a week later, I got a call from Dr. Jimmy Epting telling me that a resolution had been made with United Utility and that the rate increase was going to drop from in excess of 30 percent to down around 3 percent, and I was very satisfied with that outcome.

2.0

2.1

Now, the rate increase that we're talking about today is approximately 53 percent. Now, I am an independent businessman, and I understand profits and I understand profits have been squeezed, and I understand how costs have been going up, but if I have a supplier that comes to me and says, "I'm increasing the cost of your materials by 53 percent," I'm going to go look for another supplier. The problem I've got here is, I don't have another supplier. United Utility has a monopoly on our area, as far as sewer service goes. And I have no problem with a rate increase, but 53 percent is an excess.

And the one thing that really concerns me in all this is, in my discussions with Dr. Jimmy Epting, president of North Greenville University, United Utility was given the wastewater treatment plant that they are using to run our sewer service. So they had no startup costs, as far as the plant goes. And so my question is, what does this 53 percent encompass? Somebody needs to explain that to me, because I really can't understand why the excess of that type of increase. If we're -- if I need \$1 million to run my business, I don't think I'm going to accept \$30,000 and walk away. And

that's basically what we're talking about when we 1 talk about 100 percent increase and then drop it 2 down to 3 percent. 3 So that is my concern and, being that United 4 Utility is a monopoly in our area, I understand 5 that you folks are here to protect us, and I ask 6 that you do that. And I appreciate your time. 7 Thank you, very much. 8 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Thank you. If you'll wait 9 to see if there any questions, please. Mr. Hoefer? 10 MR. HOEFER: Thank you, Madam Chairman. 11 12 CROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. HOEFER: 13 Mr. Bennett, how long have you lived at 33 Pinerock 14 15 Drive? 16 Since September 2002. Since 2002, and where are you employed? 17 18 I have my own company; it's Focus Sales & Marketing Group, in Tiger Hill, South Carolina. 19 Focus Sales & --2.0 Q 2.1 Focus, F-o-c-u-s. 22 Uh-huh. And what does Focus Sales & Marketing Group do? We sell industrial fabrics. 23 Could you tell me what kind of industrial fabrics? 24 We sell spun-bond fabrics, polypropylene/polyester, 25 Α

- needle-punch polypropylene and polyester, into the carpet market, composites, things of that nature.
- Q How did you come to be included in a discussion with Dr.
- 4 Epting and his attorneys about the last rate case?
- Mhen the last rate increase came through, one of my neighbors came to me and said that he was going to North Greenville to meet with Dr. Epting, and that Dr. Epting had asked if anybody else in the neighborhood would be
- 9 willing to come and sit in, and I told him, yes, I
- would.
- 11 **Q** Okay. And who was at the meeting besides you and your
- neighbor and Dr. Epting?
- 13 **A** It was Dr. Epting, and the gentleman representing North
- Greenville -- Joe is one of the gentlemen at North
- Greenville University. I can't remember his name. I'm
- sorry.
- 17 **Q** You mentioned earlier that there were some attorneys
- present. Do you remember who they were?
- 19 **A** I don't, sir.
- 20 **Q** Okay.
- 21 A Oh, wait, wait. Wait. I do, too. Duke? A gentleman
- 22 -- Mr. Duke?
- 23 **Q** Was it Duke McCall?
- 24 A I don't have a last name.
- 25 **Q** Okay.

- A Jimmy Epting, me -- and I just got first names -- Buddy and Joe. Sorry.
- 3 **Q** Buddy works at North Greenville?
- 4 A No, sir, he's my neighbor.
- 5 **Q** What's Buddy's last name?
- 6 A I'm a bad neighbor. I'm afraid I can't tell you.
- 7 **Q** Okay. Is it still called Cherokee Valley?
- 8 A It is, sir.
- 9 \mathbf{Q} Okay. Do you have any connection with North Greenville
- 10 College other than that your property adjoins?
- 11 A I was a volunteer football coach in 2003, but since
- then, no.
- 13 **Q** Are you a graduate of the University?
- 14 A No, sir, I'm a graduate of the University of South
- 15 Carolina.
- 16 **Q** Thank you, very much.
- 17 **A** Thank you.
- 18 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 19 BY MR. JORDAN:
- 20 **Q** Mr. Bennett, I just have one or two questions. You said
- that, in Cherokee Valley, the sewer service is provided
- by United Utility; is that correct.
- 23 A Yes, sir.
- 24 **Q** Okay. Is the water service also provided by that
- company?

No, sir, it's not. It's provided by Blue Ridge Rural 1 Α Water System. 2 MR. JORDAN: Okay. No further questions. 3 Thank you. 4 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Ms. Edwards? 5 MS. EDWARDS: No questions. 6 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: All right. Commissioners? 7 [No response] 8 **EXAMINATION** 9 BY CHAIRMAN FLEMING: 10 All right. I'd like to ask about the service -- quality 11 12 of service you've had. 13 I put a lot of thought into that, and, it works. That's about all I can tell you. 14 15 All right, very good. And your billing system? We pay a flat rate, and right now I think it's a little 16 over \$48, \$48.24, something like that. 17 18 A month? You get a bill --Per month, yes, ma'am. 19 2.0 Q All right. And, you know, that's one thing, as far as personally 2.1 I'm concerned, I would be willing to pay on a usage rate 22 if that would help. That's it. 23 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Okay. Thank you. If there 24 are no more questions, you may step down. 25

WITNESS: Thank you, very much. 1 [WHEREUPON, the witness was excused.] 2 MR. MINGES: I'd like to call Darrel M. Rogers 3 to come forward and be sworn in. 4 5 [Witness sworn/affirmed] THEREUPON came. 6 7 DARREL Μ. ROGERS. who, having been first duly sworn/affirmed, testified as 8 follows:. 9 WITNESS: Darrel Rogers. I live at 2228 10 Surfside Drive in Anderson, 29625. 11 Last year when we went through this, we had 12 13 more people, more time to put together a good case. I found out about this hearing on Thursday. 14 15 really don't have any of the things I would have 16 had, to be prepared. But I do know that if I move my house across 17 18 Centerville Road to another neighborhood where it's West Anderson Water Company, I would be paying \$30 19 2.0 every two months. As it stands, I pay \$50 every That's 240 percent more than my neighbors. 2.1 month. And now they want to almost double that? I'll 22 probably be paying very close to what I pay for 23 electric, for water, if this rate increase goes 24 through. And that's all I have to say. 25

1	CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Mr. Hoefer.
2	CROSS EXAMINATION
3	BY MR. HOEFER:
4	Q Mr. Rogers, aren't you a customer of Utilities Services
5	of South Carolina?
6	A That's what comes in my bill, yeah.
7	Q Yes. And you're aware this is not a Utilities Services
8	of South Carolina rate case, but a United Utility
9	Companies rate case?
10	A It said that we were part of that, in what I read in the
11	newspaper.
12	Q Well, if this case didn't involve the sewer service you
13	receive from Utilities Services of South Carolina, would
14	you be here tonight?
15	A I thought it did involve us.
16	MR. HOEFER: Okay. Thank you
17	MR. JORDAN: No questions.
18	MS. EDWARDS: No questions.
19	CHAIRMAN FLEMING: All right. Commissioners,
20	are there any questions?
21	[No response]
22	CHAIRMAN FLEMING: All right. Thank you.
23	[WHEREUPON, the witness was excused.]
24	MR. MINGES: And A.B. Brown, would you please
25	come forward?

MR. BROWN: Yes, sir. 1 2 [Witness sworn/affirmed] THEREUPON came, 3 B. BROWN, JR., ARTHUR 4 who, having been first duly sworn/affirmed, testified as 5 follows: 6 7 WITNESS: My name is Arthur Brown, Jr. I live at 204 Christopher Drive, about seven miles south 8 down US 29, and I'm on the sewer system with United Utility. 10 And I've been at this address for about 30 11 12 years or better, and every time they want to go up, 13 they always ask for some exuberant amount, and you people maybe give them half of it, or a certain 14 15 percentage of it. Somewhere along the line, this has got to stop. You know, if they can show 16 17 evidence that they need a 50 or a 53 percent 18 increase, then they should get it. But if they can't show it, they shouldn't get anything. You 19 2.0 know? Because they were lying. Thank you. CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Mr. Brown, if you could 2.1 22 just wait to see if there are questions. **WITNESS**: Oh, okay. 23 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Mr. Hoefer? 24 25

CROSS EXAMINATION 1 BY MR. HOEFER: 2 Mr. Brown, could you tell me again your address? 3 204 Christopher Drive. 4 Is that in a subdivision, sir? 5 Q Yes. Shambert Forest. 6 7 MR. HOEFER: Shambert Forest? Okay. Thank you, very much. I appreciate it. 8 CROSS EXAMINATION 9 BY MR. JORDAN: 10 Mr. Brown, what do you do for a living? 11 I'm retired. 12 Okay. How long have you been retired? 13 Oh, about five years. I retired from Owens Corning 14 15 Fiberglass. Could you say that again? I'm sorry. 16 Owens Corning Fiberglass. 17 Okay, and what did you do there? 18 Q I was a welder. 19 MR. JORDAN: Okay. Thank you. 2.0 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Just a minute, Mr. Brown. 2.1 22 Got to go around. **WITNESS**: Oh, okay. 23 MS. EDWARDS: I have no questions. Thank you. 24 25 **WITNESS**: Oh, okay.

CHAIRMAN FLEMING: All right. Commissioners. 1 Commissioner Mitchell. 2 **EXAMINATION** 3 BY COMMISSIONER MITCHELL: 4 Q How you doing, Mr. Brown? Glad to have you out tonight. 5 Thank you, sir. 6 7 Could you tell me about -- is your service -- once again, is your service adequate? Or how would you 8 describe your service over the years? 9 It goes and comes. We had sewage running in our yard 10 for almost six months one time, and all the people could 11 do was come down and put a little light lime on it. Our 12 13 yard really looked good, you know. It was on a line that they really didn't know they had, and it took us 14 15 around six months for them to get the man that worked there -- he had retired -- and he told them that the 16 line belonged to them and, you know, they finally came 17 18 in there and fixed it. But you know, these people -- they hire the highest 19 priced people around to do their maintenance work. Like 2.0 2.1 Roto-Rooter is the highest priced people around, and I 22 just live right above the pond and, you know, a guy comes in there a couple days, a couple hours three days 23 a week, you know. I mean, I'd like to really know what 24 cost increase they have, you know, incurred. 25

- 1 **Q** All right. Have you had any difficulties since -- I
 2 believe you stated that was six years ago, was that
 3 right, when you had --
- 4 **A** Something like that.
- 5 **Q** -- the sewage in the yard?
- 6 A Yeah, I believe I was still working.
- 7 **Q** And you mentioned Roto-Rooter was on the scene. And was 8 that at an expense of the company, or was that --
- That was at the expense of United Utility. They didn't clean up the mess that run in my yard. They just hire them on occasions to unstop the drain lines, the sewer lines.
- 13 **Q** So you really -- you haven't had any problems since then?
- 15 **A** Oh, no.
- 16 **Q** It's worked pretty good?
- 17 **A** Yes, sir.
- What about -- well, any other problems in your community
 there, that you're aware of, or has service been pretty
 well over years?
- A Not that I know of. Service has been, you know, fairly good for at least 30 years that I know about. Of
- course, I think this thing has changed hands a few
- times, or it did when I first moved over there.
- ${f Q}$ Was the present company now in charge six years ago, or

1 were you aware? Α 2 Yes. COMMISSIONER MITCHELL: Thank you. That's all 3 I have, Madam Chairman. 4 **CHAIRMAN FLEMING**: Are there other questions? 5 [No response] 6 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: All right. 7 WITNESS: Thank you. 8 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: You may step down. 9 [WHEREUPON, the witness was excused.] 10 MR. MINGES: Madam Chairman, Mr. Brown is the 11 last person who signed up to speak. 12 13 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Well, is there anyone else who would like to speak to this issue? I know 14 15 there are several other people here this evening. 16 [No response] CHAIRMAN FLEMING: Well, we appreciate your 17 18 coming out tonight. This information will be put into the record, and if you want to follow the case 19 2.0 -- I know there were some questions -- you can go 2.1 on our Docket Management System, and under 2009-22 479-WS, and you can follow the case there. Thank you, so much, for being here, and this 23 hearing -- right, okay. And there will be a 24 hearing in Columbia -- what is the date of that? 25

MR. MINGES: That's March 23rd. 1 CHAIRMAN FLEMING: -- March 23rd, and we 2 certainly would welcome any of you who would like 3 to come. If you testified tonight, you would not 4 be able to testify at the hearing, but we would 5 certainly welcome your being there. 6 7 MR. MINGES: Just to give you the address, that's going to be in the Commission's hearing room 8 at 101 Executive Center Drive, in Columbia, South 9 Carolina. 10 Thank you. CHAIRMAN FLEMING: All right. This hearing is 11 12 now adjourned. [WHEREUPON, at 6:30 p.m., the hearing in 13 the above-entitled matter was adjourned, 14 15 to reconvene at 6:00 p.m., March 15, 2010, in Gaffney, South Carolina.] 16 17 18 19 2.0 2.1 22 23 24 25

CERTIFICATE

I, Jo Elizabeth M. Wheat, CVR-CM-GNSC, do hereby certify that the foregoing is, to the best of my skill and ability, a true and correct transcript of all the proceedings had and testimony adduced in an evening public hearing held in the above-captioned matter before the Public Service Commission of South Carolina:

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand on this the 16th day of March, 2010.

Jo Elizabeth M. Wheat, CVR-CM-GNSC

ATTEST:

Jocelyn G. Boyd

INTERIM CHIEF CLERK/ADMINISTRATOR

ocely D. Boyd